

Alternatives

This *Cooperative Management Plan/Environmental Assessment* describes two alternatives for the future management of Moccasin Bend: alternative 1 – continuation of existing conditions and alternative 2 – Moccasin Bend National Historical park. In addition, five other alternatives were analyzed during the planning process and subsequently rejected (these are discussed later in this section).

ALTERNATIVE 1: CONTINUATION OF EXISTING CONDITIONS

Concept

This alternative describes the activities of the current public and private land managers (see Alternative 1 – Continuation of Existing Conditions map). Land managers would continue their operations without overall coordination, planning, or direction.

Management

Current property owners and lessees would continue to manage their operations according to their individual mission. These operations are mutually exclusive, and no coordination among public and private property owners and managers is envisioned.

The Moccasin Bend Mental Health Hospital is operated by the state of Tennessee. The facility would continue its operations for the foreseeable future, but its long-term future is uncertain. The state is in the process of analyzing its mental health delivery system. The location of regional mental health hospitals across the state is a key issue under consideration.

The privately leased Moccasin Bend Golf Course would continue its operations at least until the expiration of the lease in 2005. The lessee has indicated it would seek a long-term extension from the city to keep the course open.

The Hamilton County Sheriff's Department and the Chattanooga Police Department would

continue to use the firing range and training facility on the east side of Moccasin Bend. In addition, other law enforcement entities such the Federal Bureau of Investigation and the Bureau of Alcohol, Tax, and Firearms would continue to use the site as a training facility.

The Chattanooga Radio Control Club would continue to seek renewal of its annual lease from the city and county. They have no plans to relocate the facility used by its 100 members.

The Colonial Pipeline would continue to use its 50-foot easement in which two high pressure petroleum pipelines traverse the Moccasin Bend archeological resource area.

The Electric Power Board's 47kV transmission lines would continue to carry electrical power across Moccasin Bend on its 150-foot-wide easement through the archeological resource area.

The 5,000 watt AM radio transmission towers would continue to be used by station WDEF. The station has no plans to expand operations on this privately owned site.

The privately owned residence would continue to be inhabited.

Resource Preservation and Protection

Current landowners would continue to manage natural and cultural resources according to their individual mandates. Existing property owners would continue to consider and evaluate possible future development of Moccasin Bend.

Resource protection would continue to be provided by the Native American Reserve Force (a volunteer unit attached to the Hamilton County Sheriff's Department), which has established regular patrols to protect American Indian sites. The archeological and Civil War sites would continue to be protected by the presence of regular patrols.

Streambank erosion along the Tennessee River would continue especially on the southwestern and western sides of the national historic landmark, unless funding is provided to stem the severe erosion.

Public Use

The existing entry and internal road and trail system would continue to be used by Moccasin

Bend's various patrons. No new roads or trails are planned for the site.

Informal interpretation would continue at the American Indian sites at Moccasin Bend as well as the Civil War emplacements on Stringers Ridge.

ALTERNATIVE 2: MOCCASIN BEND NATIONAL HISTORICAL PARK

Concept

This alternative contains a description of a potential new national park system unit, Moccasin Bend National Historical Park. The new park would focus on the nationally significant archeological and historic resources at Moccasin Bend. The new park would be administered through the superintendent of Chickamauga and Chattanooga National Military Park. The success of this potential new park would be dependent on developing a coalition of interested public and private entities and working closely with federally recognized and culturally affiliated American Indian groups, all committed to the future preservation and interpretation of Moccasin Bend.

Management

The federal government would own (in fee simple) and the National Park Service would administer the 956 acres that include the national historic landmark. A phasing scenario for acquiring Moccasin Bend is shown on the Alternative 2 – Phasing Plan map. The National Park Service would cooperate with other parties to preserve, protect, and interpret the historic sites outside the boundary associated with the Trail of Tears National Historic Trail. Moccasin Bend National Historical Park would be staffed and funded by the National Park Service, and other sources of funding would be used as they became available. Moccasin Bend would be designated as a national historical park by an act of Congress and would be administered through the superintendent of Chickamauga and Chattanooga National Military Park. The National Park Service would encourage participation by American Indian groups in the protection, preservation, and interpretation of their heritage. The National Park Service would work under a memorandum of agreement with Hamilton County to use the expertise and experience of the Native American Reserve Force for security and protection of the site, including American Indian and other cultural resources, concurrent with NPS jurisdiction.

A general management plan for Moccasin Bend National Historical Park would guide future

management of the area. It would ensure protection and preservation of natural, cultural, and scenic resources, describe visitor experience and use, and plan for facility development for the next 15 to 20 years. An advisory group could be formed to guide the general management planning process and to provide advice on the future of Moccasin Bend.

Phasing

As stated earlier, in order for Moccasin Bend to become a unit of the national park system, the existing incompatible uses should be removed and the cultural landscape restored. In order to provide a quality visitor experience, ensure comprehensive protection of archeological resources, and tap the potential of attracting large numbers of visitors to the site, the National Park Service would need the current uses removed. The phasing plan as shown on the Alternative 2 – Phasing Plan map and chart provides an orderly and timely removal of uses and restoration of the cultural landscape. The National Park Service would receive rehabilitated land in four phases. By 2009 the park unit would be complete. It is recognized that this is an ambitious phasing plan due to the complex issues surrounding the mental health hospital, the controversy surrounding the golf course, and the funding issues regarding land acquisition and restoration of the cultural landscape.

It is envisioned that the city of Chattanooga, Hamilton County, and the state of Tennessee would use their existing authorities to acquire those portions of Moccasin Bend not currently in state, county, or city ownership and turn those parcels over to the National Park Service.

A memorandum of understanding with the culturally affiliated American Indian tribes could be adopted once Moccasin Bend has been designated as a unit of the national park system. This would ensure that culturally appropriate treatments of archeological resources and subsequent interpretation of the American Indian story would be formalized.

PHASING PLAN FOR MOCCASIN BEND

Phase D By year 2009	Phase D By year 2009	Phase D By year 2009	Phase D By year 2009
NPS receives city/county and state land*	NPS receives city/county and state land*	NPS receives city/county and state land*	NPS receives remaining state land*
Stabilize riverbank	Remove law enforcement firearm training range and restore cultural landscape	Remove golf course and restore cultural landscape	Remove mental health hospital complex and restore cultural landscape
	Remove model airplane facility and restore cultural landscape		Acquire private residence
			Acquire WDEF property
			Place electrical transmission lines/towers underground
			Moccasin Bend National Historical Park – fully operational

* Refer to Phasing Plan map.

Resource Preservation and Protection

The National Park Service would establish a unified, systematic approach to cultural and natural resource management. Federal laws, rules, regulations, guidelines, and NPS management policies would guide the preservation and protection of cultural and natural resources at Moccasin Bend. Although timing and coordination must be considered due to the phased approach to implementation of future NPS activities at Moccasin Bend, it would be desirable to enter into formal agreements with all pertinent public and private entities concerning resource protection and visitor use of those portions of Moccasin Bend not under direct NPS management until well into the 21st century. The National Park Service, working

closely with tribal, federal, state, and local governments, other professionals, and various interested parties, would prepare a systematic and comprehensive plan for research regarding prehistoric and historic archeological resources. Due to the sensitivity of the archeological resources, the National Park Service would work closely with American Indian groups that have a cultural affiliation with Moccasin Bend.

A comprehensive plan would be prepared for the preservation and protection of the natural resources of Moccasin Bend. A plan for restoring the cultural landscape of Moccasin Bend is needed. Special attention would be paid to riverbank stabilization, particularly in those areas where there has been a loss of archeological resources or loss is imminent.

The National Park Service would consult on a formal basis with federally recognized tribes regarding the various mandates contained in the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act of 1990 (NAGPRA). The National Park Service would be committed to sensitive, collaborative, and timely consultations with federally recognized American Indian tribes concerning possible future survey, evaluation, protection, use, and interpretation at known burial areas and sites. The National Park Service would be actively involved with its partners to avoid NAGPRA and other cultural resource management law and policy violations during the period between the Park Service agreeing to take the site and its actual transfer of title to the federal government. Initially this is especially important if during the transitional period the present landowners conduct any ground-disturbing activity, including land cleanup and rehabilitation (incompatible use and hazardous waste removal, and cultural landscape restoration), and razing buildings, in preparation for eventual transfer. Such ground-disturbing activities could damage archeological resources.

The archeological sites on Moccasin Bend have undergone a series of professional investigations since 1915. The collections of artifacts from this fieldwork are housed in several different institutions affiliated with the archeologists who conducted the excavations. Unfortunately, the location of the materials from the 1915 fieldwork by C. B. Moore is unknown. The 1964 excavation artifacts collected by the University of Tennessee are curated by the university's Frank H. McClung Museum in Knoxville. The 1982–84 testing by the Chattanooga Anthropological Association at site 40 HA 146 produced 17 boxes of artifacts and the fragmented remains of 20 individuals that had been disturbed by vandals. The Tennessee Division of Archeology curates this material under accession number 82-99. The unassociated, unaffiliated human remains recovered are under NAGPRA inventory number 731. These items are on loan to the University of Tennessee, Department of Sociology/Anthropology, for research purposes. Numerous artifacts including burial associations from the sites are in the possession of private collectors in the Chattanooga area. These artifacts are probably not retrievable.

All future research conducted after possible designation of Moccasin Bend as a unit of the national park system would come under the

purview of applicable guidelines, in particular those referenced in chapter 6, "Management of Archeological Resources," contained in *NPS-28: Cultural Resource Management Guideline*. The artifacts now under state control and curation could be consolidated with future NPS collections either onsite or at the University of Tennessee, Chattanooga branch. On an interim basis, these public collections could be made available for use by the National Park Service in exhibits, research, and educational programs following discussions with the existing collections managers.

Public Use

The type and degree of appropriate public use would be prescribed in the general management plan. Federal laws, rules, regulations, and guidelines and NPS management policies would be followed. The American Indian occupation of the site, Spanish exploration and settlement of the southeastern United States, contact points between native and nonnative people, the Trail of Tears, and the Civil War would be interpretive themes.

The Friends of Moccasin Bend have proposed a visitor center/museum site outside the national historic landmark boundary (see the Alternative 2 – Moccasin Bend National Historical Park map). The National Park Service would support this proposal and assist in planning for the facility. American Indians would also help with planning to ensure that cultural items are displayed properly and that interpretation of their heritage is comprehensive. The National Park Service could enter into a cooperative agreement to provide staffing, training, and technical support to those operating the visitor center/museum. Any private organization permitted to engage in interpretive activities in or near the proposed park would be required to consult with representatives of affiliated tribes under the same rules as if the interpretive center were operated directly by the National Park Service. The proposed visitor center/museum is on the route of the Trail of Tears National Historic Trail. As a nonfederal facility, it would be eligible for certification as a complementary interpretive facility for the national historic trail. The community has also proposed that the riverwalk be connected from downtown Chattanooga to this facility. Access by alternative modes of transportation, such as electric buses,

walking, biking, and boats, at clearly identified access points would be encouraged.

There would be no commercial uses or active recreation facilities such as ballfields, swimming pools, recreation centers, golf courses, or other large-scale development. The National Park Service would work closely with local governments and the private sector to provide an external gateway and historic setting for Moccasin Bend.

Management Areas

While a general management plan will be required to provide future direction for resource protection and preservation, provision of appropriate uses, and park operations, a conceptual framework for dealing with resource protection and preservation and the provision of appropriate visitor use is presented. This conceptual framework is based on existing information and would certainly change as more information is gathered and analyzed over the next 10 years. Two management areas are described below:

Visitor Development Area. This area is where most visitor facilities would be located, such as roads, parking areas, restrooms, shade structures, and information and orientation kiosks. It is envisioned that an electric shuttle bus system would operate during the peak months at Moccasin Bend. It is assumed that this would be a self-sustaining transit system that would be paid for by the users of the system.

Cultural Preservation Area. This area contains the primary archeological resources identified to-date. Preservation and protection of these resources would be of primary importance and emphasis. Interpretation of the American Indian stories and the Civil War would be provided. Hiking trails and interpretive wayside exhibits would be appropriate development within this area. Restoration of the cultural landscape would be an important action.

Cost Estimates

While it would be premature to begin site planning for Moccasin Bend, it is important to provide general cost estimates for riverbank

stabilization; the removal of incompatible uses, which requires cleanup, rehabilitation, and restoration of the cultural landscape; undergrounding electrical transmission lines; broad resource management and visitor development costs; and potential future staffing costs. Cost estimates for the two private parcels of land will be prepared at a later date.

The costs shown below are a conceptual government estimate (Class C) and will be refined after more detail is obtained.

Riverbank Stabilization – \$4.5 million.

This includes riverbank stabilization from river miles 457.8 to 462 and archeological monitoring and mitigation. This cost could be borne by the National Park Service as well as other agency funding sources.

Law Enforcement Firearm Training Range – \$360,000. Included in this estimate is removal of all buildings, shooting range facilities, hazardous material, parking lot and road, and restoration of the cultural landscape. This does not include relocation costs or archeological monitoring during restoration of the site.

Model Airplane Facility – \$100,000.

Included in this estimate is the removal of structures and the landing strip as well as restoration of the cultural landscape. This does not reflect relocation costs of this use and archeological monitoring.

Golf Course – \$2.2 million. This estimate reflects demolition of the club house, other buildings, the parking lot, and cart tracks. In addition, it includes restoration of the cultural landscape, but it does not include archeological monitoring.

Mental Health Hospital – \$1.7 million. This cost reflects demolition of all structures onsite as well as asbestos removal before demolition. This also reflects restoration of the cultural landscape. This estimate does not include costs for archeological monitoring during demolition and landscape restoration and relocation of services and facilities.

Undergrounding Electrical Transmission Lines – \$6.4 million. Included in this estimate is placing the 46kV and 12kV electrical transmission lines underground on Moccasin Bend. This also includes the costs of risers which are needed when there is a transition from overhead to underground. This does not include placing the transmission lines under the Tennessee River. It does not include archeological monitoring costs.

Park Development Costs – \$3.1–\$3.6 million. This is an initial approximate cost. A general management plan (which includes significant public involvement) and detailed design would be required to determine a more accurate estimate. This estimate is based on a minimal level of development consisting of interpretive trails, parking areas, shade structures, restrooms, information/orientation kiosks, rehabilitating the existing road, constructing interpretive wayside exhibits, and publishing several brochures for self-guiding trails. This estimate also includes a park office and maintenance facility. This cost would be borne by the National Park Service.

Park Operations and Maintenance Costs – \$925,000–\$1.1 million/year. This estimate assumes that Moccasin Bend National Historical Park would have its own superintendent and approximately 19 FTEs. Staff would maintain park facilities, preserve and protect park resources, provide for visitor use and interpretive services, and work closely with all levels of government and the local community. This cost would be borne by the National Park Service.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED BUT REJECTED

The following section contains five alternatives that were formulated early in the planning process, evaluated, and subsequently rejected from further consideration. The principal reasons for their rejection are the absence of an effective management entity, the uncertainty of sufficient financial and human resources to develop and operate a park unit, and extremely limited support expressed in the extensive public participation process held during the winter and spring of 1998.

Tribal Park

Management. A coalition of federally recognized American Indian groups comprised of Cherokees and Creeks would manage Moccasin Bend as a tribal park. The management entity would provide staffing for administration, visitor use and interpretation, and protection. Funding would be provided by the tribes, grants from the Bureau of Indian Affairs, National Park Service, and the state of Tennessee. The boundary of the tribal park would be the 956-acre Moccasin Bend Archeological District National Historic Landmark.

Resource Preservation and Protection. The associated American Indian groups would be responsible for resource protection and preservation. Streambank erosion would be controlled by the tribal park with funding provided by multiple agencies. There would be no archeological fieldwork or excavation within the tribal park for the foreseeable future. The tribal park would promote limited reconstruction of the Indian village. Only American Indians would have access to the park's known burial sites. Policing of the park would be conducted by the tribal management entity. The Brown's Ferry site and the route of the Trail of Tears across Moccasin Bend would be identified and protected through partnership arrangements with existing landowners, and the tribal park would take the lead in providing interpretation at these two outlying resources.

Public Use. A visitor center would be developed in the park by adaptively reusing a portion of the mental health complex. Access to the burial sites would be restricted to American Indians. There would be no development for active recreation except for traditional American Indian rites and ceremonies. Interpretive programs would be conducted by American Indians. The emphasis would be on American Indian history. The Civil War sites at Stringers Ridge would be a secondary theme. Interpretation would be provided by American Indians.

Analysis. This alternative is not feasible for the following reasons. The Cherokees and Creeks in Tennessee, Alabama, North Carolina, and Oklahoma have rejected this alternative as unfeasible and do not support its further discussion. The federally recognized American Indian groups do not have strong representation in the

immediate Chattanooga area. Since the American Indian groups are far removed geographically from Moccasin Bend, it would be extremely difficult for them to manage a tribal park. The American Indian groups have indicated they do not have the funding and the professional experience in park development and management to engage in and operate such a large-scale undertaking. It is unlikely that the existing state and local land-managing entities would cede Moccasin Bend acreage to the tribes. Little supportive sentiment for this alternative developed during the public participation phase. Most of the tribes have or will have approved resolutions supporting NPS administration of the site.

National Reserve

Management. Management of the 956-acre Moccasin Bend Archeological District National Historic Landmark would be the responsibility of the National Park Service, the state of Tennessee, Hamilton County, the city of Chattanooga, and American Indian groups. A comprehensive management plan would be prepared and approved by the various land-managing entities. Each unit of Moccasin Bend National Reserve would be administered by the pertinent manager under the auspices of the comprehensive plan. Funding would be provided by each land-managing entity and other to be determined sources. Each party would staff its designated portion of Moccasin Bend National Reserve.

Resource Preservation and Protection.

Existing land uses would continue. Erosion control would be provided by the reserve partners. There would be no archeological fieldwork or excavation at Moccasin Bend. The Indian village would be reconstructed based on the known archeological record. Access to the burial areas would be restricted to American Indians. The Native American Reserve Force would provide security.

Public Use. A visitor center would be developed near the reserve possibly by the Friends of Moccasin Bend. The primary themes interpreted would be the American Indian history by the tribal park and the Civil War story by the National Park Service. Existing uses would continue including the golf course, the model airplane club, the radio towers, and various electrical and gas rights-of-way. Diverse recreational activities would be

provided. Future site development and commercialization would be at the discretion of the various land-managing entities.

Analysis. This alternative is not feasible for the following reasons. The two primary landowners, the state of Tennessee and the city of Chattanooga and Hamilton County, are not interested in this approach. There has been no willingness shown by these landowners to give up lands to the National Park Service on Stringers Ridge for preserving and telling the Civil War story. They are not willing to give up lands to the American Indian groups to preserve and tell the American Indian story. More importantly, the American Indian groups have not expressed an interest in a tribal park and would not be interested in managing a portion of the site. The Friends of Moccasin Bend would likely be reluctant to consider developing a visitor center adjacent to the national historic landmark, since they are interested in NPS designation of Moccasin Bend. All of the current landowners on Moccasin Bend have widely diverse missions and, while they work together, they are not interested in changing their missions to become a national reserve. Finally, the continuation of the existing incompatible uses at Moccasin Bend weakens effective resource management and seriously deters providing a meaningful visitor experience.

Federal Commission

Management. The 956-acre Moccasin Bend Archeological District National Historic Landmark would be designated as a national park system unit in compliance with all pertinent NPS management policies, guidelines, and regulations. The site would be administered by a federal commission with a paid staff. The commission would be comprised of federal, state, local, tribal, and private interests. The commission would prepare a comprehensive plan for Moccasin Bend that would be approved by the secretary of the interior. Commission staff working with NPS employees would provide day-to-day administration, protection/preservation, visitor use, interpretation, and security. Technical assistance and support would be provided at the discretion of the commission. The park would receive federal funding. Other potential sources of funding would be explored by the commission.

Resource Preservation and Protection.

Commission staff working with NPS employees would be responsible for resource preservation and protection. The commission would be responsible for erosion control. Limited archeological fieldwork would be permitted at Moccasin Bend. Brown's Ferry and the nearby Trail of Tears segment would be protected and interpreted through cooperative agreements with the commission. Future land uses at Moccasin Bend would be determined by the commission. Security would be provided by the Native American Reserve Force through cooperative agreement with the commission.

Public Use. Alternative modes of transportation to the park would be encouraged. The visitor center built by the Friends of Moccasin Bend would be placed outside the park boundary. A riverwalk connection would link the visitor center to the river. Interpretive services would be provided by the commission staff, which may include American Indians. The major themes would be American Indian and Civil War history. Recreational activities would be permitted that are appropriate to the site. General public use with selective restrictions would be permitted. The site would not be commercialized.

Analysis. This alternative was found to be not feasible. While this model has been successful elsewhere, no support was expressed by the planning partners or the public for this alternative during the public participation phase. It was felt

that a federal commission could result in a duplication of effort and potential conflicts regarding resource preservation and the provision of appropriate public uses, especially when considering that Moccasin Bend would become a unit of the national park system. Federal commissions work well when the partners and the public support them; however, no support was expressed during this planning effort. To accomplish its mission, a federal commission would receive funding through annual congressional appropriations, with no guarantee of long-term funding. This is especially true since most commissions have a limited life expectancy.

State Historic Site

Moccasin Bend would be managed as a state historic site. This alternative is not feasible because the state does not support this idea due to the cost of development, operations, and management. No public support developed during public involvement for this alternative.

Land Trust

Moccasin Bend would be administered by a land trust. This alternative is not feasible because the Tennessee River Gorge Trust is not interested in acquiring or operating Moccasin Bend due to its limited resources. It is unlikely that the existing landowners would be willing to transfer lands to a land trust. No support developed for this alternative during the public participation phase.